Narrative overviews

Lesley Rushton
Epidemiology and Public Health
l.rushton@imperial.ac.uk

Carrying Out a Narrative Review

task

To investigate the likelihood that there is an association between an environmental or occupational exposure or other hazard and an adverse health outcomes in humans

by

Reviewing all available studies relevant to the exposure and/or health outcome and preparing a qualitative and/or quantitative assessment

To Investigate an Association Between an Exposure and Human Health Impact Need to Consider

- Exposure
 - environmental levels
 - personal monitoring
- Toxicology
 - mechanisms
- Human health effects
 - epidemiology
 - volunteer studies
 - public health impact

What Makes a Good Critical Review?

- Clear presentation of the question
- Clear presentation of how review conducted
- Accuracy of data reported
- Scientific rigor data, argument
- Clarity and transparency presentation, argument
- Clear conclusion

Conduct of Review

- Like any other scientific effort should be reproducible
- Establish scope at outset
- Systematic and recorded literature searches and other methods of obtaining information
- Criteria for selection and inclusion of studies
- Criteria for reporting/summarising studies

What Data to Use

As far as possible should be available to reader

- Peer-reviewed
- Publicly available
- In final form
- Source identified

Evaluating and Summarising Individual Studies

- Rigorous scientific presentation of data
- Clear explanation (even of first principles if necessary)
- Constructive criticism (include what is good and relevant)

Description of Human Study

- Where
- When
- Study population
- Reference populations/controls
- Exposure
- Study design
- Basic data numbers of cases observed /expected,
- exposed / unexposed
- Outcomes, variables
- Statistical methods

Exposure Data

- Clear description of agent(s)
- Past, present, possibly projections of future exposure
- Details of how exposures measured
- Temporal and spatial differences and trends
- Applicability of exposure measurements to
- individuals/populations of concern (time and place)
- Fate, behaviour, persistence, bioaccumulation
- Regulations, controls, guidelines

Toxicological Data

- Relevant experimental studies
- Pharmacokinetics and pharmacodynamics
- Mechanisms

Presentation of Individual Study Summaries

Group in a logical structured way

- Time
- Place
- Study Type
- Health Outcome
- Exposure variable
- Confounders
- Statistical methods
- Results
- Biases

Which studies are relevant to an evaluation of causality?

Evidence for Causality

- Strength of association
- Consistency
- Exposure-response

Weighing the evidence

- Expert judgement
- Quantitative methods

TITLE: RECREATIONAL EXPOSURE TO SUNLIGHT AND LACK OF INFORMATION AS RISK FACTORS FOR CUTANEOUS MALIGNANT MELANOMA. RESULTS OF AN EUROPEAN ORGANISATION FOR RESEARCH AND TREATMENT OF CANCER (EORTC) CASE-CONTROL STUDY IN BELGIUM, FRANCE AND GERMANY AUTHOR: AUTIER (1994)

HYPOTHESIS:

STUDY DESCRIPTION						EXPOSURE AND HEALTH OUTCOME			RESULTS	
Location	Type of study	Data collection method	Date of study	Study population	Reference population	Measure of sun exposure	Other risk factors/ Confounders	Outcome variables	Narrative description of basic results	Statistical methods